

# VOLKSWAGEN AKTIENGESELLSCHAFT

**Frequently Asked Questions** 

**MSCI ESG Research** 

October 2015



### **CONTENTS**

The Facts	. 3
Has MSCI ESG Research noted any warning signs in the previous assessments?	. 3
2. Why are Toxic Emissions (NOx emissions) not considered a key issue of concern for the Automobile Industry given this controversy?	. 4
3. Could this be an endemic issue, besides VW?	. 4
4. Does MSCI verify corporate disclosure?	. 5
5. Could this scandal impact other industries (supply chain, e.g. auto components companies)?	5



#### THE FACTS:

On September 18th, German car manufacturer Volkswagen (VLKAY) came under fire for allegedly underreporting car emissions in the U.S. The case affects 482,000 models with diesel powered engines in the US (VOLKSWAGEN Jetta, Beetle, Golf and Audi A3). The U.S Environmental Protection Agency announced that the company could be penalized up to USD 37,500 per vehicle, or a total of more than USD 18 billion, since Volkswagen has sold almost half a million of these diesel vehicles since 2008.

In early 2014, the International Council on Clean Transportation began to review discrepancies in the emissions of a number of Volkswagen diesel cars. As a consequence, the U.S. Environment Protection Agency opened an investigation into Volkswagen in May 2014, as it was revealed on September, 18th 2015. Volkswagen cooperated with authorities and recalled approximately 500,000 vehicles to fix the reason for higher NOx emissions. However, there had been no indication that Volkswagen systematically and intentionally manipulated diesel vehicles. Moreover, the company had not been involved in similar cases (of less severity) in the previous years.

On Tuesday, September 22nd, CEO Martin Winterkorn admitted that the problem was potentially bigger than originally reported by the media. Internal investigations at Volkswagen pointed to potential emissions discrepancies for 11 million vehicles sold worldwide. On Wednesday, September 23rd, Winterkorn stepped down from his position.

On September 30<sup>th</sup>, MSCI ESG Research downgraded Volkswagen from BBB to CCC. MSCI ESG Research is monitoring further development of the case.

# 1. DID MSCI ESG RESEARCH NOTE ANY GOVERNANCE CONCERNS IN PREVIOUS ASSESSMENTS?

MSCI ESG Research has had corporate governance concerns about Volkswagen. In April 2015, scion of the Porsche family, Ferdinand Piëch, resigned as chairman of the company's supervisory board following a short-lived clash with CEO Martin Winterkorn, precipitated by the former chairman publicly announcing that he had "distanced" himself from the CEO. This power struggle raised questions as to the effectiveness and stability of the company's management.



# 2. WHY ARE TOXIC EMISSIONS (NOX EMISSIONS) NOT CONSIDERED A KEY ISSUE OF CONCERN FOR THE AUTOMOBILE INDUSTRY GIVEN THIS CONTROVERSY?

MSCI ESG Research considers the case primarily linked to business ethics and corporate governance. The intentional manipulation of emissions test results raises questions over business ethics and governance practices at Volkswagen. The potential involvement of the company's executive board would present severe violations of business ethics practices. At the same time, the potential scenario that executive management at VW was not aware of the issue would pose questions about effective control mechanisms and leadership at the German carmaker.

Volkswagen has been accused of having manipulated NOx emissions test results in the US. NOx refers to the mono-nitrogen oxides nitric oxide (NO) and nitrogen dioxide (NO2). These emissions are local air pollutants, not to be confused with the greenhouse gas nitrous oxide (N20). NOx emissions are associated with environmental and health impacts such as acid rain or respiratory diseases.

NOx emissions are generated during the combustion of oil, gas or coal. Key sources of NOx emissions include industrial processes, power plants, and the transportation sector. However, NOx emissions are not considered a key issue for the automobile industry, as air pollutants from a carmaker's fleet are lower compared to other companies in the transportation sector such as shipping companies. NOx emissions linked to road transport have significantly fallen in the past years compared to other key sources. According to the European Environmental Agency, NOx emissions from road traffic decreased by 48% between 1990 and 2014. This decrease is due to technological improvements and relatively stringent regulations, especially in the U.S. Thus, in comparison to other environmental impact of the automobile industry such as carbon emissions, air pollutants from vehicles are currently not considered a key issue.

MSCI ESG Research reviews its key issue selection by industry on an annual basis in order to take into consideration any necessary changes.

#### 3. COULD THIS BE AN ISSUE ENDEMIC TO THE SECTOR?

As of September 23rd, there has been no indication that other carmakers are involved in the manipulation of NOx emissions testing. However, the automobile industry will likely come under higher levels of regulatory scrutiny in the short to medium term. The EPA and the California Air Resources Board have started gathering other manufacturers' vehicles to test for data manipulation. The German government also announced the plan to investigate the



matter, while South Korean regulators plan an investigation of NOx emissions of VW Jetta and Gold models and Audi A3 cars produced in 2014 and 2015. If similar concerns are found, South Korea's environment ministry probe would be expanded to all German diesel imports, which have surged in popularity in recent years in a market long dominated by local producers Hyundai and Kia.us

The issue raises questions about the future of diesel technology in the U.S., Europe and other regions. In general, diesel powered cars make up more than half of all new cars on the road in Europe. One of their major advantages is linked to diesel engines' higher fuel efficiency over petrol engines resulting in lower fuel prices for customers. However, in the U.S., diesel cars represent less than 1% of the market. The Volkswagen scandal raises questions about the future marketability of diesel engines.

Aside from VW, other German carmakers Daimler and BMW are at risk of scrutiny and potential consumer backlash triggered by reputational damage. Other non-German carmakers with a presence in the diesel market, such as General Motors, and Fiat Chrysler face potential investigations.

### 4. DOES MSCI VERIFY CORPORATE DISCLOSURE?

As part of the MSCI ESG Rating process, all companies are given an opportunity to participate in the data verification process by reviewing and commenting on their company's reports. As with all companies, VW was included in this process and given the opportunity to comment on published research. As of September 30, 2015, the company had not commented.

# 5. COULD THIS SCANDAL IMPACT OTHER INDUSTRIES (SUPPLY CHAIN, E.G. AUTO COMPONENTS COMPANIES)?

The Volkswagen case poses potentially significant business risks to suppliers that are involved in diesel technology. Volkswagen's suppliers BorgWarner and Tenneco have the highest exposure to risk due to potential decline in demand for diesel engine production and emissions control technology. BorgWarner is considered one of the leading manufacturers of diesel cold starting technology. The company offers electronically controlled quick starting systems for diesel engines. Tenneco produces diesel particulate filters currently equipping 34 passenger car and light truck models.





### **CONTACT US**

#### **AMERICAS**

esgclientservice@msci.com

+ 1 212 804 5299

### **EUROPE, MIDDLE EAST & AFRICA**

+ 44 20 7618 2510

### **ASIA PACIFIC**

+ 612 9033 9339

## ABOUT MSCI ESG RESEARCH PRODUCTS AND SERVICES

MSCI ESG Research products and services are provided by MSCI ESG Research Inc., and are designed to provide in-depth research, ratings and analysis of environmental, social and governance-related business practices to companies worldwide. ESG ratings, data and analysis from MSCI ESG Research Inc. are also used in the construction of the MSCI ESG Indexes. MSCI ESG Research Inc. is a Registered Investment Adviser under the Investment Advisers Act of 1940 and a subsidiary of MSCI Inc.

#### **ABOUT MSCI**

For more than 40 years, MSCl's research-based indexes and analytics have helped the world's leading investors build and manage better portfolios. Clients rely on our offerings for deeper insights into the drivers of performance and risk in their portfolios, broad asset class coverage and innovative research.

Our line of products and services includes indexes, analytical models, data, real estate benchmarks and ESG research.

MSCI serves 98 of the top 100 largest money managers, according to the most recent P&I ranking.

For more information, visit us at www.msci.com.



# NOTICE AND DISCLAIMER

This document and all of the information contained in it, including without limitation all text, data, graphs, charts (collectively, the "Information") is the property of MSCI Inc. or its subsidiaries (collectively, "MSCI"), or MSCI's licensors, direct or indirect suppliers or any third party involved in making or compiling any Information (collectively, with MSCI, the "Information Providers") and is provided for informational purposes only. The Information may not be modified, reverse-engineered, reproduced or redisseminated in whole or in part without prior written permission from MSCI.

The Information may not be used to create derivative works or to verify or correct other data or information. For example (but without limitation), the Information may not be used to create indexes, databases, risk models, analytics, software, or in connection with the issuing, offering, sponsoring, managing or marketing of any securities, portfolios, financial products or other investment vehicles utilizing or based on, linked to, tracking or otherwise derived from the Information or any other MSCI data, information, products or services.

The user of the Information assumes the entire risk of any use it may make or permit to be made of the Information. NONE OF THE INFORMATION PROVIDERS MAKES ANY EXPRESS OR IMPLIED WARRANTIES OR REPRESENTATIONS WITH RESPECT TO THE INFORMATION (OR THE RESULTS TO BE OBTAINED BY THE USE THEREOF), AND TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT PERMITTED BY APPLICABLE LAW, EACH INFORMATION PROVIDER EXPRESSLY DISCLAIMS ALL IMPLIED WARRANTIES (INCLUDING, WITHOUT LIMITATION, ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF ORIGINALITY, ACCURACY, TIMELINESS, NON-INFRINGEMENT, COMPLETENESS, MERCHANTABILITY AND FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE) WITH RESPECT TO ANY OF THE INFORMATION

Without limiting any of the foregoing and to the maximum extent permitted by applicable law, in no event shall any Information Provider have any liability regarding any of the Information for any direct, indirect, special, punitive, consequential (including lost profits) or any other damages even if notified of the possibility of such damages. The foregoing shall not exclude or limit any liability that may not by applicable law be excluded or limited, including without limitation (as applicable), any liability for death or personal injury to the extent that such injury results from the negligence or willful default of itself, its servants, agents or sub-contractors.

Information containing any historical information, data or analysis should not be taken as an indication or guarantee of any future performance, analysis, forecast or prediction. Past performance does not guarantee future results.

The Information should not be relied on and is not a substitute for the skill, judgment and experience of the user, its management, employees, advisors and/or clients when making investment and other business decisions. All Information is impersonal and not tailored to the needs of any person, entity or group of persons.

None of the Information constitutes an offer to sell (or a solicitation of an offer to buy), any security, financial product or other investment vehicle or any trading strategy.

It is not possible to invest directly in an index. Exposure to an asset class or trading strategy or other category represented by an index is only available through third party investable instruments (if any) based on that index. MSCI does not issue, sponsor, endorse, market, offer, review or otherwise express any opinion regarding any fund, ETF, derivative or other security, investment, financial product or trading strategy that is based on, linked to or seeks to provide an investment return related to the performance of any MSCI index (collectively, "Index Linked Investments"). MSCI makes no assurance that any Index Linked Investments will accurately track index performance or provide positive investment returns. MSCI inc. is not an investment adviser or fiduciary and MSCI makes no representation regarding the advisability of investing in any Index Linked Investments.

Index returns do not represent the results of actual trading of investible assets/securities. MSCI maintains and calculates indexes, but does not manage actual assets. Index returns do not reflect payment of any sales charges or fees an investor may pay to purchase the securities underlying the index or Index Linked Investments. The imposition of these fees and charges would cause the performance of an Index Linked Investment to be different than the MSCI index performance.

The Information may contain back tested data. Back-tested performance is not actual performance, but is hypothetical. There are frequently material differences between back tested performance results and actual results subsequently achieved by any investment strategy.

Constituents of MSCI equity indexes are listed companies, which are included in or excluded from the indexes according to the application of the relevant index methodologies. Accordingly, constituents in MSCI equity indexes may include MSCI Inc., clients of MSCI or suppliers to MSCI. Inclusion of a security within an MSCI index is not a recommendation by MSCI to buy, sell, or hold such security, nor is it considered to be investment advice.

Data and information produced by various affiliates of MSCI Inc., including MSCI ESG Research Inc. and Barra LLC, may be used in calculating certain MSCI indexes. More information can be found in the relevant index methodologies on www.msci.com.

MSCI receives compensation in connection with licensing its indexes to third parties. MSCI Inc.'s revenue includes fees based on assets in Index Linked Investments. Information can be found in MSCI Inc.'s company filings on the Investor Relations section of www.msci.com.

MSCI ESG Research Inc. is a Registered Investment Adviser under the Investment Advisers Act of 1940 and a subsidiary of MSCI Inc. Except with respect to any applicable products or services from MSCI ESG Research, neither MSCI nor any of its products or services recommends, endorses, approves or otherwise expresses any opinion regarding any issuer, securities, financial products or instruments or trading strategies and MSCI's products or services are not intended to constitute investment advice or a recommendation to make (or refrain from making) any kind of investment decision and may not be relied on as such. Issuers mentioned or included in any MSCI ESG Research materials may include MSCI Inc., clients of MSCI or suppliers to MSCI, and may also purchase research or other products or services from MSCI ESG Research. MSCI ESG Research materials, including materials utilized in any MSCI ESG Indexes or other products, have not been submitted to, nor received approval from, the United States Securities and Exchange Commission or any other regulatory body.

Any use of or access to products, services or information of MSCI requires a license from MSCI. MSCI, Barra, RiskMetrics, IPD, FEA, InvestorForce, and other MSCI brands and product names are the trademarks, service marks, or registered trademarks of MSCI or its subsidiaries in the United States and other jurisdictions. The Global Industry Classification Standard (GICS) was developed by and is the exclusive property of MSCI and Standard & Poor's. "Global Industry Classification Standard (GICS)" is a service mark of MSCI and Standard & Poor's.