



# **MSCI'S FEEDBACK ON IFRS FOUNDATION CONSULTATION PAPER ON SUSTAINABILITY REPORTING**

MSCI

December 2020

## INTRODUCTION

MSCI appreciates the opportunity to comment on the **IFRS Foundation Consultation Paper on Sustainability Reporting**

### About MSCI

#### MSCI ESG Research

For over 40 years, MSCI ESG Research has measured and modelled Environmental, Social and Governance (ESG) risk<sup>1</sup>. MSCI is a leading provider of ESG ratings, indexes and analytical tools. We aim to help investors integrate ESG across their entire investment process; powering better investment decisions.

#### Our solutions:

\*First ESG provider to assess companies based on industry financial materiality, dating back to 1999. Only dataset with live history (12+ years) demonstrating economic relevance<sup>2</sup>. For over 11 years, we have rated companies on their exposure to, and management of, industry-specific ESG risks. We rate nearly 14,000 issuers representing more than 680,000 securities, with 90% of equity and fixed income market value. Our research is used by over 1,400 clients globally. Clients can use ESG ratings to support fundamental and quant analyses, portfolio construction and risk management and thought leadership and engagement.

\* MSCI ESG Indexes: MSCI is the world's largest provider of ESG indexes with over 1,500 ESG equity and fixed Income Indexes leveraging MSCI ESG Research data to support ESG integration, screening and impact approaches. Several global asset owners have selected MSCI ESG Indexes, with over \$180 billion allocated in recent years<sup>3</sup>. The indexes can also be used as the basis for exchange-traded-funds and other index-based products.

\* MSCI ESG Analytics: Our ESG research, data and indexes are available within MSCI's analytics systems. MSCI Analytics clients can explore ESG exposures on 680,000 securities and 8 million derivatives to support security selection, portfolio construction, stress testing, and risk and performance attribution analysis.



MSCI ESG Research products and services are provided by MSCI ESG Research LLC, and are designed to provide in-depth research, ratings and analysis of environmental, social and governance-related business practices to companies worldwide. ESG ratings, data and analysis from MSCI ESG Research LLC. are also used in the construction of the MSCI ESG Indexes.

For the purposes of the ESG metrics for the ESG benchmarks disclosures, the ESG metrics are provided by MSCI ESG Research LLC. MSCI ESG Indexes are provided by MSCI Inc. and utilize information from, but are not provided by, MSCI ESG Research LLC. MSCI Limited is the benchmark administrator for the MSCI Indexes under the EU Benchmark Regulation. ESG ratings, data and analysis from MSCI ESG Research LLC. are also used in the construction of the MSCI ESG Indexes.

MSCI ESG Research LLC is a Registered Investment Adviser under the Investment Advisers Act of 1940 and a subsidiary of MSCI Inc.

- 1. Through MSCI ESG Research and its legacy companies KLD, Innovest, IRRRC, and GMI Ratings*
- 2. Origins of MSCI ESG Ratings established in 1999. Produced time series data since 2007*
- 3. Based on publicly available information in press releases published from 2014 to date*

## **IFRS Foundation Consultation Paper on Sustainability Reporting**

### **Consultation Questions**

**Q1. Is there a need for a global set of internationally recognised sustainability reporting standards?**

- (a) If yes, should the IFRS Foundation play a role in setting these standards and expand its standard-setting activities into this area?**
- (b) If not, what approach should be adopted?**

A1. Yes, we welcome initiatives that promote material ESG disclosures. Sustainability disclosures are helpful when used to compare ESG performance among companies. A global set of internationally recognized sustainability reporting standards will help in improving comparability of disclosures and, in our view, aid policy makers and investors in making informed decisions. Greater transparency resulting out of better disclosures are welcomed by such stakeholders in our experience. Global sustainability reporting standards may also lead to better disclosures from companies due to uniformity of framework.

**Q2. Is the development of a sustainability standards board (SSB) to operate under the governance structure of the IFRS Foundation an appropriate approach to achieving further consistency and global comparability in sustainability reporting?**

A2. Yes, a Sustainability Standards Board (SSB) operating under the governance structure of the IFRS Foundation may be an appropriate body to develop and maintain a global set of sustainability-reporting standards. Operating alongside the International Accounting Standards Board (IASB), we believe the SSB would benefit from the three-tier governance structure of the IFRS Foundation and the oversight of Trustees and Monitoring Board of IFRS Foundation. This may enhance the credibility of the SSB's efforts and potentially assist in gaining buy-in from investors, policy makers and reporting organizations.

**Q3. Do you have any comment or suggested additions on the requirements for success as listed in paragraph 31 (including on the requirements for**

**achieving a sufficient level of funding and achieving the appropriate level of technical expertise)?**

A3. We agree with the requirements for success as listed in the paper. We believe that gaining support from different stakeholders and developing synergies with other sustainability reporting initiatives will be critical. A reduction in the complexity of sustainability reporting is likely to be welcomed by companies. Improvements in disclosures due to their reduced complexity and consistency may help meet the demands of greater transparency from investors and policy makers. The IFRS Foundation has long-standing experience of standard-setting for financial reporting through IASB. SSB, while working alongside IASB, would potentially gain from this experience while enacting a robust governance structure. Developing adequate technical expertise among staff would be an essential requirement if the IFRS Foundation does not have prior experience of sustainability reporting standard-setting.

In our view, the overall success of the SSB would depend on its meeting the expectations of investors, corporates, policy makers and other stakeholders while enriching the sustainability reporting landscape.

**Q4. Could the IFRS Foundation use its relationships with stakeholders to aid the adoption and consistent application of SSB standards globally? If so, under what conditions?**

A4. The IFRS Foundation is in favorable position to leverage its global presence and engage with stakeholders for establishing SSB developed sustainability reporting standards. However, the extent of adoption and application hereof would be highly dependent on engagement with users of these standards for reporting such as issuers and users of reported information such as investors and policy makers.

**Q5. How could the IFRS Foundation best build upon and work with the existing initiatives in sustainability reporting to achieve further global consistency?**

A5. Recently, global standard setters have expressed their commitment towards working together for consistent sustainability reporting standards.<sup>[1]</sup> The IFRS Foundation has an opportunity to engage with them towards achieving greater consistency.

<sup>[1]</sup> <https://www.cdp.net/en/articles/media/comprehensive-corporate-reporting>

**Q6. How could the IFRS Foundation best build upon and work with the existing jurisdictional initiatives to find a global solution for consistent sustainability reporting?**

A6. The IFRS Foundation can leverage its global presence and relationships with stakeholders developed through IASB for promoting a consistent and global solution for sustainability reporting. While there is some amount of overlap between existing jurisdictional initiatives, these have been largely developed in silos. The IFRS Foundation may be able to play an important role by engaging with policy makers to expedite the evolution of these initiatives and increase comparability between regional disclosures. To succeed, we believe the SSB may need to develop capability among its staff to evaluate regional disclosure initiatives and define a roadmap to achieve consistent sustainability reporting.

**Q7. If the IFRS Foundation were to establish an SSB, should it initially develop climate-related financial disclosures before potentially broadening its remit into other areas of sustainability reporting?**

A7. Recommendations on climate-related financial disclosures by Financial Stability Board's Task Force on Climate-related Financial Disclosures (TCFD) have steadily gained popularity since introduction in 2017. Over 1,500 organizations have expressed support and many have begun to implement TCFD recommendations towards improving their climate-related financial disclosures. Considering recent progress in climate-related disclosure frameworks, our view would be that the SSB consider the creation of a full disclosure framework which builds on existing frameworks in line with the objective of developing a global set of sustainability standards.

**Q8. Should an SSB have a focused definition of climate-related risks or consider broader environmental factors?**

A8. Companies are affected by climate change in different ways. Extreme weather may damage assets at a company facility or the introduction of new climate change policies may require technological change. Climate-related impacts and financial risks emerge from physical scenarios relating to several extreme weather hazards, such as extreme heat and cold, heavy snowfall and precipitation, wind gusts, tropical cyclones, coastal flooding/sea level rise and fluvial flooding. <sup>[1]</sup>

We are of the opinion that climate change should be part of broader environmental risk and that the SSB consider broader environmental factors while defining climate-related risks.

<sup>[1]</sup> Climate Value-at-Risk, MSCI, 2020.

**Q9. Do you agree with the proposed approach to materiality in paragraph 50 that could be taken by the SSB?**

A9. We believe that meaningful sustainability disclosures should be considered in terms of materiality/economic relevance because requesting companies to report on data not directly relevant to their sector may add unnecessary costs or burdens. Also, the data disclosed may not be relevant to that issuer and could lead to company bias or greenwashing by showing positive disclosures in areas that are not material for that sector.

We support the proposed approach of initially focusing efforts on the sustainability information most relevant to investors and other market participants.

**Q10. Should the sustainability information to be disclosed be auditable or subject to external assurance? If not, what different types of assurance would be acceptable for the information disclosed to be reliable and decision-useful?**

A10. Considering less than widespread adoption of sustainability reporting, not all companies may be able to publish externally assured sustainability reports. In order to motivate companies to adopt SSB proposed sustainability standards, it would be helpful if the sustainability report contents are self-declared to be complete and reliable. However, the ultimate objective of sustainability reporting should be external assurance of disclosures, enhancing credibility of published information.

**Q11. Stakeholders are welcome to raise any other comment or relevant matters for our consideration.**

A11. It is widely understood that ESG and climate-related risks and opportunities can vary by market sector and industry: what is material to one may not be as material to others. ESG and climate-related risks and opportunities, and which are considered to be material, can also change over time.

MSCI recently introduced an ESG Industry Materiality Map, a representation of the current Key ESG Issues and their contribution to issuers' MSCI ESG Ratings. It is part of our ESG Ratings transparency initiatives and may be of assistance to the IFRS in its deliberations. Please see <https://www.msci.com/our-solutions/esg-investing/esg-ratings/materiality-map>.

We also highlight MSCI's *Foundations of ESG Investing* research. Covering both equities and fixed income asset classes, our research suggests that changes in a company's ESG characteristics may be a useful financial indicator and may also be suitable for integration into policy benchmarks and financial analyses. Please see <https://www.msci.com/our-solutions/esg-investing/foundations-of-esg-investing>.

## Contact us

clientservice@msci.com

### AMERICAS

Americas	1 888 588 4567 *
Atlanta	+ 1 404 551 3212
Boston	+ 1 617 532 0920
Chicago	+ 1 312 675 0545
Monterrey	+ 52 81 1253 4020
New York	+ 1 212 804 3901
San Francisco	+ 1 415 836 8800
São Paulo	+ 55 11 3706 1360
Toronto	+ 1 416 628 1007

### EUROPE, MIDDLE EAST & AFRICA

Cape Town	+ 27 21 673 0100
Frankfurt	+ 49 69 133 859 00
Geneva	+ 41 22 817 9777
London	+ 44 20 7618 2222
Milan	+ 39 02 5849 0415
Paris	0800 91 59 17 *

### ASIA PACIFIC

China North	10800 852 1032 *
China South	10800 152 1032 *
Hong Kong	+ 852 2844 9333
Mumbai	+ 91 22 6784 9160
Seoul	00798 8521 3392 *
Singapore	800 852 3749 *
Sydney	+ 61 2 9033 9333
Taipei	008 0112 7513 *
Thailand	0018 0015 6207 7181 *
Tokyo	+ 81 3 5290 1555

\* = toll free

### ABOUT MSCI

MSCI is a leading provider of critical decision support tools and services for the global investment community. With over 45 years of expertise in research, data and technology, we power better investment decisions by enabling clients to understand and analyze key drivers of risk and return and confidently build more effective portfolios. We create industry-leading research-enhanced solutions that clients use to gain insight into and improve transparency across the investment process.

To learn more, please visit [www.msci.com](http://www.msci.com).

*The process for submitting a formal index complaint can be found on the index regulation page of MSCI's website at: <https://www.msci.com/index-regulation>.*

## Notice and disclaimer

This document and all of the information contained in it, including without limitation all text, data, graphs, charts (collectively, the "Information") is the property of MSCI Inc. or its subsidiaries (collectively, "MSCI"), or MSCI's licensors, direct or indirect suppliers or any third party involved in making or compiling any Information (collectively, with MSCI, the "Information Providers") and is provided for informational purposes only. The Information may not be modified, reverse-engineered, reproduced or disseminated in whole or in part without prior written permission from MSCI.

The Information may not be used to create derivative works or to verify or correct other data or information. For example (but without limitation), the Information may not be used to create indexes, databases, risk models, analytics, software, or in connection with the issuing, offering, sponsoring, managing or marketing of any securities, portfolios, financial products or other investment vehicles utilizing or based on, linked to, tracking or otherwise derived from the Information or any other MSCI data, information, products or services.

The user of the Information assumes the entire risk of any use it may make or permit to be made of the Information. NONE OF THE INFORMATION PROVIDERS MAKES ANY EXPRESS OR IMPLIED WARRANTIES OR REPRESENTATIONS WITH RESPECT TO THE INFORMATION (OR THE RESULTS TO BE OBTAINED BY THE USE THEREOF), AND TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT PERMITTED BY APPLICABLE LAW, EACH INFORMATION PROVIDER EXPRESSLY DISCLAIMS ALL IMPLIED WARRANTIES (INCLUDING, WITHOUT LIMITATION, ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF ORIGINALITY, ACCURACY, TIMELINESS, NON-INFRINGEMENT, COMPLETENESS, MERCHANTABILITY AND FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE) WITH RESPECT TO ANY OF THE INFORMATION.

Without limiting any of the foregoing and to the maximum extent permitted by applicable law, in no event shall any Information Provider have any liability regarding any of the Information for any direct, indirect, special, punitive, consequential (including lost profits) or any other damages even if notified of the possibility of such damages. The foregoing shall not exclude or limit any liability that may not by applicable law be excluded or limited, including without limitation (as applicable), any liability for death or personal injury to the extent that such injury results from the negligence or willful default of itself, its servants, agents or sub-contractors.

Information containing any historical information, data or analysis should not be taken as an indication or guarantee of any future performance, analysis, forecast or prediction. Past performance does not guarantee future results.

The Information should not be relied on and is not a substitute for the skill, judgment and experience of the user, its management, employees, advisors and/or clients when making investment and other business decisions. All Information is impersonal and not tailored to the needs of any person, entity or group of persons.

None of the Information constitutes an offer to sell (or a solicitation of an offer to buy), any security, financial product or other investment vehicle or any trading strategy.

It is not possible to invest directly in an index. Exposure to an asset class or trading strategy or other category represented by an index is only available through third party investable instruments (if any) based on that index. MSCI does not issue, sponsor, endorse, market, offer, review or otherwise express any opinion regarding any fund, ETF, derivative or other security, investment, financial product or trading strategy that is based on, linked to or seeks to provide an investment return related to the performance of any MSCI index (collectively, "Index Linked Investments"). MSCI makes no assurance that any Index Linked Investments will accurately track index performance or provide positive investment returns. MSCI Inc. is not an investment adviser or fiduciary and MSCI makes no representation regarding the advisability of investing in any Index Linked Investments.

Index returns do not represent the results of actual trading of investable assets/securities. MSCI maintains and calculates indexes, but does not manage actual assets. Index returns do not reflect payment of any sales charges or fees an investor may pay to purchase the securities underlying the index or Index Linked Investments. The imposition of these fees and charges would cause the performance of an Index Linked Investment to be different than the MSCI index performance.

The Information may contain back tested data. Back-tested performance is not actual performance, but is hypothetical. There are frequently material differences between back tested performance results and actual results subsequently achieved by any investment strategy.

Constituents of MSCI equity indexes are listed companies, which are included in or excluded from the indexes according to the application of the relevant index methodologies. Accordingly, constituents in MSCI equity indexes may include MSCI Inc., clients of MSCI or suppliers to MSCI. Inclusion of a security within an MSCI index is not a recommendation by MSCI to buy, sell, or hold such security, nor is it considered to be investment advice.

Data and information produced by various affiliates of MSCI Inc., including MSCI ESG Research LLC and Barra LLC, may be used in calculating certain MSCI indexes. More information can be found in the relevant index methodologies on [www.msci.com](http://www.msci.com).

MSCI receives compensation in connection with licensing its indexes to third parties. MSCI Inc.'s revenue includes fees based on assets in Index Linked Investments. Information can be found in MSCI Inc.'s company filings on the Investor Relations section of [www.msci.com](http://www.msci.com).

MSCI ESG Research LLC is a Registered Investment Adviser under the Investment Advisers Act of 1940 and a subsidiary of MSCI Inc. Except with respect to any applicable products or services from MSCI ESG Research, neither MSCI nor any of its products or services recommends, endorses, approves or otherwise expresses any opinion regarding any issuer, securities, financial products or instruments or trading strategies and MSCI's products or services are not intended to constitute investment advice or a recommendation to make (or refrain from making) any kind of investment decision and may not be relied on as such. Issuers mentioned or included in any MSCI ESG Research materials may include MSCI Inc., clients of MSCI or suppliers to MSCI, and may also purchase research or other products or services from MSCI ESG Research. MSCI ESG Research materials, including materials utilized in any MSCI ESG Indexes or other products, have not been submitted to, nor received approval from, the United States Securities and Exchange Commission or any other regulatory body.

Any use of or access to products, services or information of MSCI requires a license from MSCI. MSCI, Barra, RiskMetrics, IPD and other MSCI brands and product names are the trademarks, service marks, or registered trademarks of MSCI or its subsidiaries in the United States and other jurisdictions. The Global Industry Classification Standard (GICS) was developed by and is the exclusive property of MSCI and Standard & Poor's. "Global Industry Classification Standard (GICS)" is a service mark of MSCI and Standard & Poor's.

MIFID2/MIFIR notice: MSCI ESG Research LLC does not distribute or act as an intermediary for financial instruments or structured deposits, nor does it deal on its own account, provide execution services for others or manage client accounts. No MSCI ESG Research product or service supports, promotes or is intended to support or promote any such activity. MSCI ESG Research is an independent provider of ESG data, reports and ratings based on published methodologies and available to clients on a subscription basis. We do not provide custom or one-off ratings or recommendations of securities or other financial instruments upon request.

Privacy notice: For information about how MSCI ESG Research LLC collects and uses personal data concerning officers and directors, please refer to our Privacy Notice at <https://www.msci.com/privacy-pledge>.