

# Consultation on Potential Enhancement of the MSCI ESG Enhanced Focus Indexes Methodology

## PROPOSAL FOR CONSULTATION

This consultation may or may not lead to the implementation of any or all of the proposed changes in the highlighted or any other MSCI indexes. Consultation feedback will remain confidential. MSCI may publicly disclose feedback if specifically requested by specific market participants. In that case, the relevant feedback would be published together with the final result of the consultation.

July 2021

# Summary

MSCI presents a consultation on proposals for the potential enhancement of the MSCI ESG Enhanced Focus Indexes methodology

The proposals modify the exclusionary screens and seek to align the index with the minimum requirements for designation as an [EU Climate Transition Benchmark \(EU CTB\)](#).

**MSCI invites feedback from market participants on or before August 10 2021, and will announce the results of the consultation on or before August 16 2021. Changes, if any, would be implemented in the November 2021 Semi-Annual Index Review (SAIR).**

# Background

- The final Delegated Act for the minimum requirements for EU CTBs (EU DA) was published in the Official Journal of the European Union, L 406, 3 December 2020<sup>1</sup>.
- MSCI proposes to enhance the MSCI ESG Enhanced Focus Indexes methodology to align the index with the minimum requirements required for designation as an EU CTB.
- The proposed index methodology retains the existing optimization-based approach that seeks to maximize exposure to environmental, social and governance (ESG) factors while maintaining risk and return characteristics similar to those of the corresponding Parent Index while adding additional constraints as required for an EU CTB.
- The proposed index methodology also incorporates additional exclusionary security-level screens related to involvement with conventional weapons and with unconventional oil and gas.

# Proposed Changes\* to Current Index Methodology

## Proposed changes to Eligibility Criteria:

- *Proposals for new screens* –
  - **Conventional Weapons:** Exclude companies deriving 5% or more revenue from the production of conventional weapons
  - **Conventional Weapons:** Exclude companies deriving 10% or more aggregate revenue from weapons systems, components and support systems and services
  - **Unconventional Oil & Gas:** Exclude companies deriving 5% or more revenues from oil sands, oil shale (kerogen-rich deposits), shale gas, shale oil, coal-seam gas, coal-bed methane as well as Arctic onshore/offshore reserves.
  - **Environmental Controversies:** Exclude companies with an MSCI Environment Controversy Score of 0 or 1 (applicable from the November 2022 SAIR)
- *Proposal to remove screen* –
  - **Oil Sands:** Revenues from Oil Sands are covered in the proposed “Unconventional Oil & Gas Screen” rendering the current screen redundant

# Proposed Changes\* to Current Index Methodology

## Proposed changes to Optimizer Setup:

- *Proposals to add optimization constraints*—
  - Minimum **7% annualized reduction** in weighted average carbon emissions (Scope 1+2+3 emissions relative to EVIC) relative to weighted average carbon emissions at the Base Date
  - Minimum **0% active weight in High Climate Impact Sector** relative to the Parent Index
  - Ratio of **wtd. avg. Green Revenue to wtd. avg. Fossil Fuels-based Revenues** to be at least equivalent to that of the Parent Index
- *Proposals to modify optimization constraints*—
  - Minimum 30% reduction in wtd. avg. carbon emissions (**Scope 1+2+3 emissions/ EVIC**) vs. Parent Index
  - Minimum 30% reduction in wtd. Avg. potential carbon emissions (**per dollar of EVIC**) vs. Parent Index
  - Ex-ante Tracking Error budget at rebalance increased to **75 basis points for developed markets**
  - **Maximum asset bound multiples are increased** to assist feasibility of new constraints
  - In cases of an initial infeasible optimization at rebalance, the **relaxation steps have been amended** to efficiently achieve a feasible index solution.

For further details, kindly refer to Slides 8 and 9.



# Appendix

---



# Proposed Index Methodology (1/3) – Eligibility Criteria

	Proposed Index Methodology	Current Index Methodology
<b>Eligibility Criteria</b>		
<b>ESG Controversies</b>	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology
<b>Missing ESG Data</b>	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology
<b>Controversial Weapons</b>	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology
<b>Nuclear Weapons</b>	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology
<b>Civilian Firearms</b>	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology
<b>Tobacco</b>	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology
<b>Thermal Coal</b>	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology
<b>Oil Sands</b>	<b>This exclusion is no longer applied as revenues from Oil Sands are covered in the “Unconventional Oil &amp; Gas” screen below</b>	As per Section 3.3 of the current index methodology
<b>Conventional Weapons</b>	<b>Exclude companies deriving 5% or more revenue from the production of conventional weapons</b>	No exclusion in the current index methodology
<b>Conventional Weapons</b>	<b>Exclude companies deriving 10% or more aggregate revenue from weapons systems, components, and support systems and services</b>	No exclusion in the current index methodology
<b>Unconventional Oil &amp; Gas</b>	<b>Exclude companies deriving 5% or more revenues oil sands, oil shale (kerogen-rich deposits), shale gas, shale oil, coal seam gas, coal bed methane as well as Arctic onshore/offshore.</b>	No exclusion in the current index methodology
<b>Environmental Controversies</b>	<b>Exclude companies with an Environment Controversy Score of 0 or 1 (This screen will be applicable from the November 2022 SAIR)</b>	No exclusion in the current index methodology

# Proposed Index Methodology (2/3) - Optimization

	Proposed Index Methodology	Current Index Methodology
<b>Optimization Setup</b>		
<b>Optimization Objective</b>	Retained in Proposed Index Methodology	Maximize ESG Score
<b>Ex Ante Tracking Error Budget</b>	Developed Markets – <b>75bps</b> (except for Pacific ex Japan with 125bps) Emerging Markets – 100bps	Developed Markets – 50bps Emerging Markets – 100bps
<b>Minimum Constituent Weight</b>	Retained in Proposed Index Methodology	Minimum constituent weight in the Screened Parent*
<b>Asset Lower Bound</b>	Maximum (Minimum constituent weight in the Screened Parent, <b>0.25</b> * Security Weight in the Screened Parent)	Maximum (Minimum constituent weight in the Screened Parent, 0.5 * Security Weight in the Screened Parent)
<b>Asset Upper Bound</b>	Minimum ( <b>5</b> * Security Weight in the Screened Parent, Security Weight in the Screened Parent +2%)	Minimum (3 * Security Weight in the Screened Parent, Security Weight in the Screened Parent +2%)
<b>Minimum Reduction in the Carbon Emission Intensity relative to the Parent Index</b>	30% - <b>calculated as per Appendix I of the MSCI EU CTB/PAB Overlay Indexes Methodology</b>	30% - calculated as per Appendix I of the MSCI Global Low Carbon Leaders Index methodology
<b>Minimum average reduction (per annum) in GHG Intensity relative to GHG Intensity of the index at the Base Date (November 2021 SAIR)</b>	<b>7%</b> - <b>calculated as per Appendix I of the MSCI EU CTB/PAB Overlay Indexes Methodology</b>	No constraint in the current index methodology
<b>Minimum Reduction in the Potential Emissions relative to the Parent Index</b>	30% - <b>Potential Emissions are now calculated per dollar of Enterprise Value Including Cash (EVIC)</b>	30% - calculated as per Appendix I of the MSCI Global Low Carbon Leaders Index methodology
<b>Ratio of Green Revenues to Fossil Fuels-based Revenues</b>	<b>Ratio of wtd. avg. Green Revenue to wtd. avg. Fossil Fuels-based Revenues to be at least equivalent to that of the Parent Index</b>	No constraint in the current index methodology
<b>Minimum active weight in High Climate Impact Sector</b>	<b>0%</b> - <b>for details regarding the definition of the High Climate Impact Sector, kindly refer to the MSCI EU CTB/PAB Overlay Indexes methodology</b>	No constraint in the current index methodology



\* The Screened Parent is constructed by excluding securities from the Parent Index using the Eligibility Criteria detailed in the index methodology. The security weights are then renormalized to 100%. Apart from the changes in the Eligibility Criteria, there is no change in the way security weights are calculated in the Screened Parent.



# Proposed Index Methodology (2/2)

	Proposed Index Methodology	Current Index Methodology
<b>Optimization Setup (contd.)</b>		
<b>Active Sector Weights</b>	Retained in Proposed Index Methodology	+/-5%
<b>Active Country Weights*</b>	Retained in Proposed Index Methodology	+/-5%
<b>One Way Turnover during May and November Index Review</b>	Retained in Proposed Index Methodology	10%
<b>One Way Turnover during Feb and Aug Index Review</b>	Retained in Proposed Index Methodology	5%
<b>Specific Risk Aversion</b>	Retained in Proposed Index Methodology	0.075
<b>Common Factor Risk Aversion</b>	Retained in Proposed Index Methodology	0.0075
<b>Infeasible Solution</b>		
<b>Relaxation Steps followed</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The turnover constraint will be relaxed up to a maximum of 5 times of the original turnover budget in steps of 5%</li> <li>The ex-ante tracking error is relaxed up to a maximum of 5 times of the original ex-ante tracking error in steps on 0.1%.</li> </ul> <p>The relaxations are completed in an alternative manner – a single step of turnover relaxation is followed by a single step of ex ante tracking error relaxation, before the turnover constraint is relaxed further.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The turnover constraint will be relaxed up to a maximum turnover of 30% in steps of 1%</li> <li>The ex-ante tracking error is relaxed up to a maximum of 5 times of the original ex-ante tracking error in steps on 0.1%.</li> </ul> <p>The turnover relaxation is completed up to a maximum of 30% before the ex-ante tracking error constraint is relaxed.</p>

\* In case there are countries in the Parent Index which weigh less than 2.5% in the Parent Index, then for such countries the active country upper bound of +5% is not applicable. When a country weighs less than 2.5% in the Parent Index then the upper bound of country weight in the MSCI ESG Enhanced Focus Index is set at three times of the country's weight in the Parent Index.

# About MSCI

MSCI is a leading provider of critical decision support tools and services for the global investment community. With over 50 years of expertise in research, data and technology, we power better investment decisions by enabling clients to understand and analyze key drivers of risk and return and confidently build more effective portfolios. We create industry-leading research-enhanced solutions that clients use to gain insight into and improve transparency across the investment process. To learn more, please visit [www.msci.com](http://www.msci.com).

# Contact us

AMERICAS	EUROPE, MIDDLE EAST & AFRICA	ASIA PACIFIC
Americas +1 888 588 4567 *	Cape Town + 27 21 673 0100	China North 10800 852 1032 *
Atlanta + 1 404 551 3212	Frankfurt + 49 69 133 859 00	China South 10800 152 1032 *
Boston + 1 617 532 0920	Geneva + 41 22 817 9777	Hong Kong + 852 2844 9333
Chicago + 1 312 675 0545	London + 44 20 7618 2222	Mumbai + 91 22 6784 9160
Monterrey + 52 81 1253 4020	Milan + 39 02 5849 0415	Seoul 00798 8521 3392 *
New York + 1 212 804 3901	Paris 0800 91 59 17 *	Singapore 800 852 3749 *
San Francisco + 1 415 836 8800		Sydney + 61 2 9033 9333
São Paulo + 55 11 3706 1360		Taipei 008 0112 7513 *
Toronto + 1 416 628 1007		Thailand 0018 0015 6207 7181 *
* = toll free		Tokyo +81 3 5290 1555
<a href="https://www.msci.com">msci.com</a>		
<a href="mailto:clientservice@msci.com">clientservice@msci.com</a>		
<a href="mailto:esgclientservice@msci.com">esgclientservice@msci.com</a>		

# Notice & disclaimer

This document and all of the information contained in it, including without limitation all text, data, graphs, charts (collectively, the "Information") is the property of MSCI Inc. or its subsidiaries (collectively, "MSCI"), or MSCI's licensors, direct or indirect suppliers or any third party involved in making or compiling any Information (collectively, with MSCI, the "Information Providers") and is provided for informational purposes only. The Information may not be modified, reverse-engineered, reproduced or disseminated in whole or in part without prior written permission from MSCI. All rights in the Information are reserved by MSCI and/or its Information Providers.

The Information may not be used to create derivative works or to verify or correct other data or information. For example (but without limitation), the Information may not be used to create indexes, databases, risk models, analytics, software, or in connection with the issuing, offering, sponsoring, managing or marketing of any securities, portfolios, financial products or other investment vehicles utilizing or based on, linked to, tracking or otherwise derived from the Information or any other MSCI data, information, products or services.

The user of the Information assumes the entire risk of any use it may make or permit to be made of the Information. NONE OF THE INFORMATION PROVIDERS MAKES ANY EXPRESS OR IMPLIED WARRANTIES OR REPRESENTATIONS WITH RESPECT TO THE INFORMATION (OR THE RESULTS TO BE OBTAINED BY THE USE THEREOF), AND TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT PERMITTED BY APPLICABLE LAW, EACH INFORMATION PROVIDER EXPRESSLY DISCLAIMS ALL IMPLIED WARRANTIES (INCLUDING, WITHOUT LIMITATION, ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF ORIGINALITY, ACCURACY, TIMELINESS, NON-INFRINGEMENT, COMPLETENESS, MERCHANTABILITY AND FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE) WITH RESPECT TO ANY OF THE INFORMATION.

Without limiting any of the foregoing and to the maximum extent permitted by applicable law, in no event shall any Information Provider have any liability regarding any of the Information for any direct, indirect, special, punitive, consequential (including lost profits) or any other damages even if notified of the possibility of such damages. The foregoing shall not exclude or limit any liability that may not be applicable law be excluded or limited, including without limitation (as applicable), any liability for death or personal injury to the extent that such injury results from the negligence or willful default of itself, its servants, agents or sub-contractors.

Information containing any historical information, data or analysis should not be taken as an indication or guarantee of any future performance, analysis, forecast or prediction. Past performance does not guarantee future results.

The Information should not be relied on and is not a substitute for the skill, judgment and experience of the user, its management, employees, advisors and/or clients when making investment and other business decisions. All Information is impersonal and not tailored to the needs of any person, entity or group of persons.

None of the Information constitutes an offer to sell (or a solicitation of an offer to buy), any security, financial product or other investment vehicle or any trading strategy.

It is not possible to invest directly in an index. Exposure to an asset class or trading strategy or other category represented by an index is only available through third party investable instruments (if any) based on that index. MSCI does not issue, sponsor, endorse, market, offer, review or otherwise express any opinion regarding any fund, ETF, derivative or other security, investment, financial product or trading strategy that is based on, linked to or seeks to provide an investment return related to the performance of any MSCI index (collectively, "Index Linked Investments"). MSCI makes no assurance that any Index Linked Investments will accurately track index performance or provide positive investment returns. MSCI Inc. is not an investment adviser or fiduciary and MSCI makes no representation regarding the advisability of investing in any Index Linked Investments.

Index returns do not represent the results of actual trading of investible assets/securities. MSCI maintains and calculates indexes, but does not manage actual assets. Index returns do not reflect payment of any sales charges or fees an investor may pay to purchase the securities underlying the index or Index Linked Investments. The imposition of these fees and charges would cause the performance of an Index Linked Investment to be different than the MSCI index performance.

The Information may contain back tested data. Back-tested performance is not actual performance, but is hypothetical. There are frequently material differences between back tested performance results and actual results subsequently achieved by any investment strategy.

Constituents of MSCI equity indexes are listed companies, which are included in or excluded from the indexes according to the application of the relevant index methodologies. Accordingly, constituents in MSCI equity indexes may include MSCI Inc., clients of MSCI or suppliers to MSCI. Inclusion of a security within an MSCI index is not a recommendation by MSCI to buy, sell, or hold such security, nor is it considered to be investment advice.

Data and information produced by various affiliates of MSCI Inc., including MSCI ESG Research LLC and Barra LLC, may be used in calculating certain MSCI indexes. More information can be found in the relevant index methodologies on [www.msci.com](http://www.msci.com).

MSCI receives compensation in connection with licensing its indexes to third parties. MSCI Inc.'s revenue includes fees based on assets in Index Linked Investments. Information can be found in MSCI Inc.'s company filings on the Investor Relations section of [www.msci.com](http://www.msci.com).

MSCI ESG Research LLC is a Registered Investment Adviser under the Investment Advisers Act of 1940 and a subsidiary of MSCI Inc. Except with respect to any applicable products or services from MSCI ESG Research, neither MSCI nor any of its products or services recommends, endorses, approves or otherwise expresses any opinion regarding any issuer, securities, financial products or instruments or trading strategies and MSCI's products or services are not intended to constitute investment advice or a recommendation to make (or refrain from making) any kind of investment decision and may not be relied on as such. Issuers mentioned or included in any MSCI ESG Research materials may include MSCI Inc., clients of MSCI or suppliers to MSCI, and may also purchase research or other products or services from MSCI ESG Research. MSCI ESG Research materials, including materials utilized in any MSCI ESG Indexes or other products, have not been submitted to, nor received approval from, the United States Securities and Exchange Commission or any other regulatory body.

Any use of or access to products, services or information of MSCI requires a license from MSCI. MSCI, Barra, RiskMetrics, IPD and other MSCI brands and product names are the trademarks, service marks, or registered trademarks of MSCI or its subsidiaries in the United States and other jurisdictions. The Global Industry Classification Standard (GICS) was developed by and is the exclusive property of MSCI and Standard & Poor's. "Global Industry Classification Standard (GICS)" is a service mark of MSCI and Standard & Poor's.

MIFID2/MIFIR notice: MSCI ESG Research LLC does not distribute or act as an intermediary for financial instruments or structured deposits, nor does it deal on its own account, provide execution services for others or manage client accounts. No MSCI ESG Research product or service supports, promotes or is intended to support or promote any such activity. MSCI ESG Research is an independent provider of ESG data, reports and ratings based on published methodologies and available to clients on a subscription basis. We do not provide custom or one-off ratings or recommendations of securities or other financial instruments upon request.

Privacy notice: For information about how MSCI collects and uses personal data, please refer to our Privacy Notice at <https://www.msci.com/privacy-pledge>.

