

MSCI's Response on FINMA's Consultation on Climate-Related Financial Risks Disclosures for Banks And Insurers

MSCI

January 2021

INTRODUCTION

MSCI ESG Research appreciates the opportunity to comment on the FINMA's Consultation on CLIMATE RELATED FINANCIAL RISKS DISCLOSURES FOR BANKS AND INSURERS

About MSCI

MSCI ESG Research

For over 40 years, MSCI ESG Research has measured and modelled Environmental, Social and Governance (ESG) risk^a. MSCI is a leading provider of ESG ratings, indexes and analytical tools. We aim to help investors integrate ESG across their entire investment process; powering better investment decisions.

Our solutions:

*First ESG provider to assess companies based on industry financial materiality, dating back to 1999. Only dataset with live history (12+ years) demonstrating economic relevance^b. For over 11 years, we have rated companies on their exposure to, and management of, industry-specific ESG risks. We rate nearly 14,000 issuers representing more than 680,000 securities, with 90% of equity and fixed income market value. Our research is used by over 1,400 clients globally. Clients can use ESG ratings to support fundamental and quant analyses, portfolio construction and risk management and thought leadership and engagement.

* MSCI ESG Indexes: MSCI is the world's largest provider of ESG indexes with over 1,500 ESG equity and fixed Income Indexes leveraging MSCI ESG Research data to support ESG integration, screening and impact approaches. Several global asset owners have selected MSCI ESG Indexes, with over \$180 billion allocated in recent years^c. The indexes can also be used as the basis for exchange-traded-funds and other index-based products.

* MSCI ESG Analytics: Our ESG research, data and indexes are available within MSCI's analytics systems. MSCI Analytics clients can explore ESG exposures on 680,000 securities and 8 million derivatives to support

security selection, portfolio construction, stress testing, and risk and performance attribution analysis.

MSCI ESG Research products and services are provided by MSCI ESG Research LLC, and are designed to provide in-depth research, ratings and analysis of environmental, social and governance-related business practices to companies worldwide. ESG ratings, data and analysis from MSCI ESG Research LLC. are also used in the construction of the MSCI ESG Indexes.

For the purposes of the ESG metrics for the ESG benchmarks disclosures, the ESG metrics are provided by MSCI ESG Research LLC. MSCI ESG Indexes are provided by MSCI Inc. and utilize information from, but are not provided by, MSCI ESG Research LLC. MSCI Limited is the benchmark administrator for the MSCI Indexes under the EU Benchmark Regulation. ESG ratings, data and analysis from MSCI ESG Research LLC. are also used in the construction of the MSCI ESG Indexes.

MSCI ESG Research LLC is a Registered Investment Adviser under the Investment Advisers Act of 1940 and a subsidiary of MSCI Inc.

a. Through MSCI ESG Research and its legacy companies KLD, Innovest, IRRG, and GMI Ratings

b. Origins of MSCI ESG Ratings established in 1999. Produced time series data since 2007

c. Based on publicly available information in press releases published from 2014 to date

1.1 Context of the consultation

In the context of Public Disclosure requirements for banks and insurers, FINMA is seeking guidance on the disclosure of climate-related financial risks with regards to

- the institution's governance structure
- a description of how short, medium and long-terms risk are affecting the institution's business and risk strategies
- the type of criteria and valuation methods that are being used for the evaluation of climate-related risks
- and the use of quantitative information such as metrics and targets to assess climate-related financial risks as well as applied methodologies.

MSCI's response focuses on quantitative metrics and outlined below are the rationale for applying quantitative metrics and our recommended methodology for doing so.

1.2 Rationale for leveraging quantitative metrics

As a market-leading provider of ESG and climate solutions we believe that it is crucial to align climate-related analytical approaches with both voluntary and mandatory disclosure requirements. The recommendations of the Task Force on Climate-related Financial Disclosures (TCFD) outline that climate scenario analysis can be both qualitative and quantitative. While a qualitative approach is better suited to frame climate risk in the context of narratives about a future world, a quantitative approach allows to measure the economic impact of climate-related risks. In this context, adopting a climate scenario approach which can quantify both climate-related costs and potential low carbon profits based on a quantitative metric may give a more accurate assessment of Value at Risk.

1.3 Recommended metric

With reference to the suggested climate scenario approach in 1.2, MSCI's Climate Value-at-Risk (Climate VaR) model provides investors with a quantitative, forward-looking analysis on how climate change may affect the investment return in portfolios. The metric allows both investors and creditors to assess and mitigate future risks from climate change, while at the same time helping to identify low carbon opportunities.

Climate VaR is closely aligned with the recommendations of the Taskforce on Climate-related Financial Disclosures (TCFD) in that it quantifies both transition and physical impacts in a climate scenario context.

On the transition side, the model identifies future policy-related costs and future green profits linked to specific emission scenario pathways. The entirety of country emission reduction pledges (Nationally Determined Contributions, NDCs) have been quantified and normalized to align with a 3°C scenario. Based on the UNEP GAP report, the model further quantifies additional emission reduction requirements necessary to achieve the goals of the Paris Agreement which is to limit global temperatures to 2°C or less by the end of the century. In addition, on the policy side, the model incorporates a Scope 2 Electricity Use and a Scope 3 Value Chain model to capture the company's ability to pass-through the cost of electricity as well as factoring in upstream and downstream impacts, for example for the automobile and oil & gas sectors. On the opportunity side, the model assesses Clean Technology revenue market shares of companies in combination with a low carbon patent scoring methodology. Finally, on the physical side, an extensive asset location database comprising of over 400,000 company facilities has been overlaid with hazards maps. Based on sector-based vulnerabilities, each location's climate-related revenue loss for 8 extreme weather hazards is computed with the help of damage and business interruption functions.

The net present value of all future climate-related costs and green profits is finally related to the current valuation of the asset to provide users with a climate stressed market valuation, assuming that climate change impacts are currently not priced in.

1.4 The methodological approach outlined

The methodology has been developed by climate and policy experts since 2015 and has gone through several development cycles in cooperation with large institutional investors such as asset owners and asset managers.

Climate Value-at-Risk provides a truly forward-looking dimension for assessing transition risks and opportunities for publicly listed companies, their issued securities as well as real assets.

The framework provides a broad number of scenarios which incorporate different scenario pathways to help assess the climate impact of investment portfolios - a total of 10 transition and 2 physical climate scenarios are available.

Furthermore, the entirety of national emission reduction pledges that countries have committed to under the goal of the Paris Agreement to limit the global temperature increase to 2° Celsius or lower have been quantified. Apart from factoring in direct emission impacts, the model also incorporates indirect impacts from electricity use (Scope 2) and the value chain (Scope 3).

On the opportunity side, Climate Value-at-Risk incorporates a score on low carbon patents to help identify the longer-term future low carbon innovation potential of companies in the transition to a low carbon economy.

Moreover, on the physical side, Climate VaR is not restricted to scoring the exposure on extreme weather hazards but goes further in that it quantifies the cost impact of these extreme weather hazards on each individual company facility in the database. This has been achieved through the development of a comprehensive vulnerability sector system that assesses cost impacts based on damage and business interruption functions for relevant sectors.

Finally, the model calculates climate-related costs and green profits on issuer level and apportions them to the equity and liability side of the business based on the Merton model, a credit risk framework. The Climate VaR for corporate bonds also considers the maturity date of individual bonds.

As such, the Climate VaR approach fully aligns with the recommendations of the Taskforce on Climate-related Financial Disclosures and future climate change regulation such as SFDR:

- The approach is fully forward-looking.
- The approach provides quantitative metrics that assess the financial impact of climate-related risks.
- The approach provides the ability to perform sophisticated quantitative scenario analysis.
- In addition to a wide variety of 2°C or lower scenarios, the approach also includes a 3°C NDC scenario.

- The approach considers both transition and physical impacts.
- The approach assesses both future risk and opportunities.
- The approach relies on emission data collected and Quality Assured when reported by companies or estimated using MSCI's own proprietary estimation model.
- The approach relies on third party verified data sets and provides a comprehensive documentation about methodology, assumptions and data sources.
- The approach provides a high degree of transparency and granular data output.
- The approach considers impacts from Scopes 1, 2 & 3.
- On the physical side, the approach considers industry-specific vulnerabilities and quantifies the cost impact from extreme weather exposure such as coastal & fluvial flooding, extreme heat & extreme precipitation.

Contact us

clientservice@msci.com

AMERICAS

Americas	1 888 588 4567 *
Atlanta	+ 1 404 551 3212
Boston	+ 1 617 532 0920
Chicago	+ 1 312 675 0545
Monterrey	+ 52 81 1253 4020
New York	+ 1 212 804 3901
San Francisco	+ 1 415 836 8800
São Paulo	+ 55 11 3706 1360
Toronto	+ 1 416 628 1007

EUROPE, MIDDLE EAST & AFRICA

Cape Town	+ 27 21 673 0100
Frankfurt	+ 49 69 133 859 00
Geneva	+ 41 22 817 9777
London	+ 44 20 7618 2222
Milan	+ 39 02 5849 0415
Paris	0800 91 59 17 *

ASIA PACIFIC

China North	10800 852 1032 *
China South	10800 152 1032 *
Hong Kong	+ 852 2844 9333
Mumbai	+ 91 22 6784 9160
Seoul	00798 8521 3392 *
Singapore	800 852 3749 *
Sydney	+ 61 2 9033 9333
Taipei	008 0112 7513 *
Thailand	0018 0015 6207 7181 *
Tokyo	+ 81 3 5290 1555

* = toll free

ABOUT MSCI

MSCI is a leading provider of critical decision support tools and services for the global investment community. With over 50 years of expertise in research, data and technology, we power better investment decisions by enabling clients to understand and analyze key drivers of risk and return and confidently build more effective portfolios. We create industry-leading research-enhanced solutions that clients use to gain insight into and improve transparency across the investment process.

To learn more, please visit www.msci.com.

The process for submitting a formal index complaint can be found on the index regulation page of MSCI's website at: <https://www.msci.com/index-regulation>.

Notice and disclaimer

This document and all of the information contained in it, including without limitation all text, data, graphs, charts (collectively, the "Information") is the property of MSCI Inc. or its subsidiaries (collectively, "MSCI"), or MSCI's licensors, direct or indirect suppliers or any third party involved in making or compiling any Information (collectively, with MSCI, the "Information Providers") and is provided for informational purposes only. The Information may not be modified, reverse-engineered, reproduced or disseminated in whole or in part without prior written permission from MSCI.

The Information may not be used to create derivative works or to verify or correct other data or information. For example (but without limitation), the Information may not be used to create indexes, databases, risk models, analytics, software, or in connection with the issuing, offering, sponsoring, managing or marketing of any securities, portfolios, financial products or other investment vehicles utilizing or based on, linked to, tracking or otherwise derived from the Information or any other MSCI data, information, products or services.

The user of the Information assumes the entire risk of any use it may make or permit to be made of the Information. NONE OF THE INFORMATION PROVIDERS MAKES ANY EXPRESS OR IMPLIED WARRANTIES OR REPRESENTATIONS WITH RESPECT TO THE INFORMATION (OR THE RESULTS TO BE OBTAINED BY THE USE THEREOF), AND TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT PERMITTED BY APPLICABLE LAW, EACH INFORMATION PROVIDER EXPRESSLY DISCLAIMS ALL IMPLIED WARRANTIES (INCLUDING, WITHOUT LIMITATION, ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF ORIGINALITY, ACCURACY, TIMELINESS, NON-INFRINGEMENT, COMPLETENESS, MERCHANTABILITY AND FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE) WITH RESPECT TO ANY OF THE INFORMATION.

Without limiting any of the foregoing and to the maximum extent permitted by applicable law, in no event shall any Information Provider have any liability regarding any of the Information for any direct, indirect, special, punitive, consequential (including lost profits) or any other damages even if notified of the possibility of such damages. The foregoing shall not exclude or limit any liability that may not by applicable law be excluded or limited, including without limitation (as applicable), any liability for death or personal injury to the extent that such injury results from the negligence or willful default of itself, its servants, agents or sub-contractors.

Information containing any historical information, data or analysis should not be taken as an indication or guarantee of any future performance, analysis, forecast or prediction. Past performance does not guarantee future results.

The Information should not be relied on and is not a substitute for the skill, judgment and experience of the user, its management, employees, advisors and/or clients when making investment and other business decisions. All Information is impersonal and not tailored to the needs of any person, entity or group of persons.

None of the Information constitutes an offer to sell (or a solicitation of an offer to buy), any security, financial product or other investment vehicle or any trading strategy.

It is not possible to invest directly in an index. Exposure to an asset class or trading strategy or other category represented by an index is only available through third party investable instruments (if any) based on that index. MSCI does not issue, sponsor, endorse, market, offer, review or otherwise express any opinion regarding any fund, ETF, derivative or other security, investment, financial product or trading strategy that is based on, linked to or seeks to provide an investment return related to the performance of any MSCI index (collectively, "Index Linked Investments"). MSCI makes no assurance that any Index Linked Investments will accurately track index performance or provide positive investment returns. MSCI Inc. is not an investment adviser or fiduciary and MSCI makes no representation regarding the advisability of investing in any Index Linked Investments.

Index returns do not represent the results of actual trading of investible assets/securities. MSCI maintains and calculates indexes, but does not manage actual assets. Index returns do not reflect payment of any sales charges or fees an investor may pay to purchase the securities underlying the index or Index Linked Investments. The imposition of these fees and charges would cause the performance of an Index Linked Investment to be different than the MSCI index performance.

The Information may contain back tested data. Back-tested performance is not actual performance, but is hypothetical. There are frequently material differences between back tested performance results and actual results subsequently achieved by any investment strategy.

Constituents of MSCI equity indexes are listed companies, which are included in or excluded from the indexes according to the application of the relevant index methodologies. Accordingly, constituents in MSCI equity indexes may include MSCI Inc., clients of MSCI or suppliers to MSCI. Inclusion of a security within an MSCI index is not a recommendation by MSCI to buy, sell, or hold such security, nor is it considered to be investment advice.

Data and information produced by various affiliates of MSCI Inc., including MSCI ESG Research LLC and Barra LLC, may be used in calculating certain MSCI indexes. More information can be found in the relevant index methodologies on www.msci.com.

MSCI receives compensation in connection with licensing its indexes to third parties. MSCI Inc.'s revenue includes fees based on assets in Index Linked Investments. Information can be found in MSCI Inc.'s company filings on the Investor Relations section of www.msci.com.

MSCI ESG Research LLC is a Registered Investment Adviser under the Investment Advisers Act of 1940 and a subsidiary of MSCI Inc. Except with respect to any applicable products or services from MSCI ESG Research, neither MSCI nor any of its products or services recommends, endorses, approves or otherwise expresses any opinion regarding any issuer, securities, financial products or instruments or trading strategies and MSCI's products or services are not intended to constitute investment advice or a recommendation to make (or refrain from making) any kind of investment decision and may not be relied on as such. Issuers mentioned or included in any MSCI ESG Research materials may include MSCI Inc., clients of MSCI or suppliers to MSCI, and may also purchase research or other products or services from MSCI ESG Research. MSCI ESG Research materials, including materials utilized in any MSCI ESG Indexes or other products, have not been submitted to, nor received approval from, the United States Securities and Exchange Commission or any other regulatory body.

Any use of or access to products, services or information of MSCI requires a license from MSCI. MSCI, Barra, RiskMetrics, IPD and other MSCI brands and product names are the trademarks, service marks, or registered trademarks of MSCI or its subsidiaries in the United States and other jurisdictions. The Global Industry Classification Standard (GICS) was developed by and is the exclusive property of MSCI and Standard & Poor's. "Global Industry Classification Standard (GICS)" is a service mark of MSCI and Standard & Poor's.

MIFID2/MIFIR notice: MSCI ESG Research LLC does not distribute or act as an intermediary for financial instruments or structured deposits, nor does it deal on its own account, provide execution services for others or manage client accounts. No MSCI ESG Research product or service supports, promotes or is intended to support or promote any such activity. MSCI ESG Research is an independent provider of ESG data, reports and ratings based on published methodologies and available to clients on a subscription basis. We do not provide custom or one-off ratings or recommendations of securities or other financial instruments upon request.

Privacy notice: For information about how MSCI ESG Research LLC collects and uses personal data concerning officers and directors, please refer to our Privacy Notice at <https://www.msci.com/privacy-pledge>.